



Information gathering template prepared for the Global Education Monitoring Report 2021 - Central and Eastern Europe, the Caucasus and Central Asia - Inclusion and education: All means all.

Turkey

This profile has been commissioned by NEPC as an input for the 2021 regional report on inclusion and education in Central and Eastern Europe, the Caucasus and Central Asia. This version is a working draft and will be subject to further copy-editing. Its content has not been edited nor verified by the GEM Report team. The views and opinions expressed in this paper, including anecdotal evidence from interviews, are those of the interviewees or researchers of this profile and should not be attributed to the Global Education Monitoring Report, to UNESCO or to NEPC. The information in this document was current in June 2020. The profile can be cited with the following reference: "Profile commissioned by NEPC for the Global Education Monitoring Report 2021 - Central and Eastern Europe, the Caucasus and Central Asia - Inclusion and education: All means all". For further information, please contact gemreport@unesco.org.

PROFILE PREPARED BY: BURCU MELTEM ARIK, ÖZGENUR KORLU, MERVE MERT, FIDAN GÖZDE ERTEKIN AND KAYIHAN KESBIÇ, EDUCATION REFORM INITIATIVE



Introduction	2
Survey reply and respondents	4
Country system overview	6
Section 1: Laws and policies	13
Section 2: Governance and finance	28
Section 3: Data	32
Section 4: Curricula, learning materials and assessments	38
Section 5: Teachers and support personnel	48
Section 6: Schools	54
Section 7: Communities, parents and students	59

Introduction

The template for the Profiles was a survey designed to collect information from countries in order to collect structured information to be used as the basis for the GEM Regional Report analysis work.

The survey respondents were specifically requested to not focus exclusively on children with disabilities, but include information on all of the groups considered to be vulnerable to exclusion or at risk of being marginalised, stereotyped or subject to discrimination, including for reasons such as gender, location, poverty, ethnicity, language, beliefs and religion, migration or displacement status, sexual orientation or gender identity expression.

The overall goal for the Profile was that the information provided in relation to each country identifies:

- 1. challenges (barriers and hinderances) and opportunities (support and ways forward) for the implementation of inclusion in education policies;
- 2. the ways in which countries monitor inclusion and exclusion in education (at individual and system levels);
- challenges (barriers and hinderances) and opportunities (support and ways forward) for supporting
 inclusion in education created by sectors other than education and arrangements needed to coordinate work among government sectors, tiers of government and with other stakeholders to
 overcome overlapping dimensions of exclusion;
- 4. key policy solutions that are being implemented and key drivers of policy change.

The Profile begins with background information on the people completing the template.

The next section provides a short descriptive overview of the country's system of inclusive education.

This is followed by main sections presenting quantitative and qualitative data linked to each of the seven themes for the report:

- 1.laws and policies;
- 2.governance and finance;
- 3.data;
- 4.curricula, learning materials and assessment;
- 5.teachers and support personnel;
- 6.schools;
- 7.communities, parents and students.

Each section begins with a key guiding question (marked in italic text) that frames the overall information provided. This is followed by the specific questions on the main issues for the topic that should be answered.

Sections 1 and 2 focus on information relating to legislation and policies.

Section 3 focuses upon available data and the aims and procedures for data collection.

Sections 4 to 7 focus on information relating to policies and policy implementation in practice.

The information provided focuses on compulsory education (i.e. potentially -pre-primary, primary and lower secondary, and possibly upper secondary education). Only specific issues related to inclusion in early childhood education and post-compulsory education were considered when necessary.

Survey reply and respondents

Has the information in this profile been discussed with and validated by a government representative?

No / We have discussed with MoNE experts but the information is not validated.

Which other people have been key informants? What is their professional role?

Expert	Expertise	Institution
Prof. Dr. Hande Sart	Special Needs Education	Boğaziçi University
Melisa Soran	Inclusive Education, Special Needs Education	Istanbul Bilgi University
Seda Akço	Right to Education, Rights in Education, Law	Humanist Buro
Ulaş Karan	Right to Education, Rights in Education, Law	Istanbul Bilgi University
Assoc. Prof. Dr. Yelkin Diker Coşkun	Curriculum and Instruction	Yeditepe University
Prof. Dr. Bülbin Sucuoğlu	Special Needs Education, Early Childhood Education	Hacettepe University

What was the main challenge during the preparation of the profile?

Partial transparency and lack of national inclusive education framework were key challenges.

Please list the 5 most informative sources on inclusion in education (academic papers, policy reviews, evaluation studies etc.) for the country published since 2015 and provide links to the originals:

- 1. ECRI Country Monitoring for Turkey
- 2. UNICEF Annual Reports
- 3. 11th Development Plan
- 4. A Situation Analysis of Inclusive Education in Secondary Schools in Turkey
- 5. The Right of Children with Disabilities to Education: Situation Analysis and Recommendations for Turkey



Country system overview

- (i) Provide a brief (maximum 1 page) narrative of the country's compulsory educational system. Specifically, provide information about:
- a. the different types of schools, institutions and educational provision within the system and the age range / ISCED levels of learners they cater for

In Turkey, compulsory education covers primary, lower secondary and upper secondary education. Primary education is for learners aged 6 to 9. There are private and public primary schools. Private schools are under the General Directorate of Private Education Institutions. Public schools are under the General Directorate of Basic Education and special education schools are under the General Directorate of Special Education and Guidance Services. ISCED Level 1

Lower secondary schools cover the age range of 10 to 13 and also can be public or private. Private schools are under the General Directorate of Private Education Institutions. Most public schools are under the General Directorate of Basic Education. İmam and Preacher Schools are under the General Directorate of Religious Education and some under the General Directorate of Special Education and Guidance Services. At the lower secondary level, there is an open lower secondary school which is under the General Directorate of Lifelong Learning, however, this school is only available to individuals above the compulsory lower secondary education age, with the exception of children with certain disabilities and children who are convicts. The open lower secondary school is not an alternative to lower secondary schools. It is aimed at individuals who were not able to complete lower secondary education and now are above the age. ISCED Level 2

Upper secondary level covers ages 14 to 17. At this level, schools are under five different General Directorates: General Directorate of Private Education Institutions, General Directorate of Secondary Education, General Directorate of Religious Education, General Directorate of Vocational and Technical Education, General Directorate of Special Education and Guidance Services. At the upper secondary level, compulsory education can also be completed in Open Education High School which is under the General Directorate of Lifelong Learning. ISCED Level 3

b. the different authorities responsible for different types of provision etc.

The Ministry of National Education is responsible for the provision of education in Turkey. Different general directorates are responsible for the operation of different levels and types of schools as stated above.

c. any major external support programmes provided in the past 5 years e.g. bilateral - GIZ (German Society for International Cooperation) and USAID; or multi-lateral e.g. UNICEF, European Union, ADB (Asian Development Bank).

One of the major external support programmes provided in the past 5 years is "Promoting Integration of Syrian Kids into the Turkish Education System" (PICTES), which is implemented as part of the EU Facility for Refugees in Turkey (FRIT). The project's first phase was carried out between 2016 and 2018. The second phase (PICTES II) that started in 2018, focuses on early childhood education and vocational training and will last 3 years. As part of PICTES, various kinds of support are being provided to Syrian children, including Turkish and Arabic language education, back-up and catch-up training and provision of educational material.

UNICEF provides education material, physical capacity (container classrooms), teacher training and programs to facilitate adaptation to school with the purpose of decreasing absence and dropout rates. UNICEF also collaborates with the MoNE to establish intervention programs for children in third grade who have not attained the necessary proficiency level in reading and mathematics.

GIZ provided support to the MoNE with the "Supporting Syrian Refugees and Turkish Host Communities – Educational Programme" which included strengthening capacities of educational institutions through teacher training.

IPA funds were/are also available for Turkey.

(ii) Are there specific features of the compulsory education system that impact on inclusion that should be kept in mind when reading the country's response?

Area	Yes/No	Description of the feature
Early tracking of learners	Yes	Address-Based Population Register System
into a particular		Science and Art Centers (BİLSEM), which offer unique
educational pathway		public education for gifted elementary and
		secondary-school aged children.
'Double-shift' patterns to	Yes	Not all students attend double-shift patterns. In
the school day (i.e. learners		2018-19, the percentage of students attending
attend for either a morning		double shift patterns was 37.8% for primary
or afternoon session)		education, 29.9% for lower secondary education and
		5.8% for higher secondary education.
Grade retention	Yes	Grade retention is possible at all levels. However, in
		primary education, grade retention is highly
		discouraged by the regulation yet can be possible
		once during primary education, with an official
		demand from the parent or due to absence. 1 In

¹ https://www.mevzuat.gov.tr/Metin.Aspx?MevzuatKod=7.5.19942&MevzuatIliski=0&sourceXmlSearch=Okul%20%C3%96ncesi (article 31, 1)

		lower secondary education, grade retention is
		possible with the decision of a board of teachers, due
		to absence or academic performance. ² In higher
		secondary education, grade retention is possible due
		to absence or academic performance. Mainstreamed
		children cannot be subject to grade retention due to
		academic performance at any level. ³
Multiple languages of	No	
instruction		
Policies on access to	N/A	Turkey has a centralised decision making and
compulsory education in		education system.
local schools		
Option of open education	Yes	In upper secondary education, students are
in upper secondary		transferred to open high school in cases where the
education		student falls into grade retention for a second time
		or if the student marries.
		In lower secondary education, if a child fails to
		complete lower secondary education by the age they
		should, they have the right to stay in lower
		secondary education for two more years. ⁴ If the child
		reaches 8th grade (last year of lower secondary
		school) at the end of those two years, they are given
		an extra year to complete 8th grade. ⁵ If they fail to
		complete during this time, they are transferred to
		open lower secondary education.

² https://www.mevzuat.gov.tr/Metin.Aspx?MevzuatKod=7.5.19942&MevzuatIliski=0&sourceXmlSearch=Okul%20%C3%96ncesi (article 31, 2b)

³ https://www.mevzuat.gov.tr/Metin.Aspx?MevzuatKod=7.5.19942&Mevzuatlliski=0&sourceXmlSearch=Okul%20%C3%96ncesi (article 31, 3)

⁴ https://www.mevzuat.gov.tr/Metin.Aspx?MevzuatKod=7.5.19942&MevzuatIliski=0&sourceXmlSearch=Okul%20%C3%96ncesi (article 19, 1b)

⁵ https://www.mevzuat.gov.tr/Metin.Aspx?MevzuatKod=7.5.19942&MevzuatIliski=0&sourceXmlSearch=Okul%20%C3%96ncesi (article 19, 1c)

(iii) In the country's system which groups are considered to be vulnerable to exclusion from education? Who has identified these groups as being vulnerable to exclusion?

Children with special needs - MoNE

Girls - MoNE

Children of seasonal mobile agricultural worker families - MoNE

Children in poverty – MoNE

Children who are forced to work - MoNE

Roma children - MoNE

Refugee children - MoNE

Children in foster care - MoNE

Children living in rural areas - MoNE

Children with illness & who are hospitalized - MoNE

LGBTİ+ individuals – NGOs

Children of internal forced migration - NGOs

Children whose mother tongue is not Turkish - NGOs

Children who are pushed to commit crime - NGOs

(iv) Please provide a brief narrative overview of the historical development of inclusion of vulnerable groups in education in the country.

In 1921, a private deaf and blind School was founded in İzmir. Starting from 1950, the responsibility of the special education services passed over to the Ministry of National Education from the Ministry of Health. The perception of special needs became an education issue rather than a health issue. To train teachers, the first Special Education Department in Gazi University in Ankara was founded in 1952. In 1955 the Research and Guidance Centre was founded in Ankara, with a role to make research and to provide a necessary and individualized education for students with special needs. Two special education classes were opened in a primary school in Ankara. In 1965, the Special Education Department in Ankara University was founded, which launched a Special Education Teaching Certificate Program in 1978. The Ministry of National Education's Department of Special Education, Guidance and Counselling services was established in 1983. Special Education Departments were founded in Anadolu University (1983) and in Gazi University (1986) to train teachers of the blind and intellectually disabled children.

The law about children needing to be protected' was enacted in 1957 as the first regulation, stating that the Ministry of National Education will implement programs for children with special education needs. Then in 1961, Primary Instruction and Education Law enacted, which clearly stated that for students with mental, physical, psychological, emotional and social disabilities special needs education must be available. Children with Special Education Needs Law (1983) was very critical in several terms: 1. "inclusive education" was mentioned with a statement that children with special needs education should be educated in regular schools with their normal peers, and 2. "special education should start at an early age" was stated. Soon after the First Special Education Committee was gathered in 1991, an

individual education plan (IEP) for every disabled child was considered. In 1997, The Statutory Decree No.573 on Special Education ratified. It clearly stated the mainstreaming of education within national legislation. "Person showing significant difference from the levels expected from their peers in terms of personal characteristics and educational proficiency due to a variety of reasons." reflected as the person in need of special education. The definition of the special education is as "the type of education provided by specially trained personnel and with specially developed teaching programs and methods, in order to meet the needs of persons requiring special education in environments suitable to their disabilities and characteristics." With the Decree, mainstreaming the education prioritized and the educational environments became places where individuals with special needs could receive their right to education with others. Beginning at an early age, personalized education plans and involvement of parents were also emphasized. Then in 2012, The Special Education Services Regulation which passed in 2006, revised.

For refugees, Turkey's humanitarian response has faced changes since the crisis in Syria first took off in 2011. The number of enrolled students increased from 230,000 in 2014-15 to 610,278 in 2017-18, 643.058 in 2018-19 and 684,919 as of January 2020. However, the percentage of children who do not go to school still remains high at close to 40 percent.

Syrian refugees fleeing the conflict started entering Turkey in April 2011. The first Temporary Refuge Center opened by the Disaster and Emergency Management Authority (AFAD) in May 2011 in Hatay. Syrian refugees living in the cities began to open their private schools for their children. In April 2013, Law on Foreigners and International Protection was published and broadly defined the educational rights of foreigners who have residence permits. In September 2013 the MoNE declared the right to education for all Syrian children who are under temporary protection, in September 2014 announced new arrangements through its circular and removed the requirement to have a residence permit to enroll in schools for Syrian children. In 2014, all non-public schools that provide education for Syrian children in and outside the camps were accredited as Temporary Education Centers (TECs) so that Syrian children could continue their education in the period they spend in Turkey before going back to their own country. In October 2014, provisions were made on the The Temporary Protection Regulation to make public schools open and official for all Syrian students who are under temporary protection including early childhood education, K-12, higher education and non-formal education programmes. To monitor the registration and the attendance of the refugee children, the MoNE with the assistance of the United Nations Children Fund, developed "Foreign Students Information Operation System", referred as YÖBİS, in 2014. School attendance of Syrian children is collected through YÖBİS in TECs, and through eokul in public schools. In September of 2016, MoNE announced that all TECs would be closed down within four years. As of 2019, most are closed, only 10.720 (%1,57) students are enrolled in TECs.

In 1997 an amendment to Law no. 4306 turned compulsory education into eight continuous years. In 2004 there was a risk of achieving gender parity. However, MoNE launched the "Hey Girls, Let's Go to School" campaign with support from UNICEF in 2003. The campaign ran in 10 provinces where the gender gap was highest, and by 2006 scaled up to 81 provinces. For secondary education, two projects launched in 2011 and 2015 with financial support from the European Commission to increase girls' enrolment rate. It took until 2007-08 for girls' net enrolment rates to match

those of boys'. A national administrative database (e-School) was launched in 2007-08. Several policy research projects were implemented to monitor non-attendance, understand the impact of the 2008 economic crisis on attendance, understand the determinants of transition to secondary education. An induction program for secondary schools to facilitate students' transition to and improve their success in 9th grade was initiated. In 2012, law no. 6287 stipulated that the education system be compulsory for 12 years, with a 4+4+4 system. The net enrolment rates for girls in secondary education rose from 69.31% in 2012-13 to 82.38%, 83.39% and 83.88% during the 2016-17, 2017-18 and 2018-19 school years, respectively. This new regulation resulted in a similar increase in the enrolment rates of boys. As a result of all these efforts, national and regional improvements have been achieved and the gender gap has narrowed considerably. However, there is still a discrepancy in enrolment rates between boys and girls at the secondary education level, which requires measures to eliminate it. In certain regions (particularly in Southeast Anatolia and Central East Anatolia), the discrepancy in net enrolment rates in secondary education are more pronounced.

The Project for Increasing Enrolment Rates, Especially for Girls Project (KEP I) was implemented between 2011-2013 with the goals of increasing girls' enrolment rates and the quality of education, as well as bringing more investments in human resources through collaborations with the private sector. The pilot project was implemented in 16 provinces. 2000 children were registered to school. Promoting Gender Equality in Education Project (ETCEP I) was implemented during 2014-2016 in order to mainstream gender equity in national educational policies and curricula. The project was implemented in 40 schools in 10 pilot provinces. Education legislation and policies and textbooks were analyzed in terms of gender equity. The Project for Increasing Enrolment Rates, Especially for Girls II (KEP II) was the continuation of KEP I and began in 2016 and implemented in 15 pilot cities. The Project for Expanding Gender-Sensitive-Approach Standards at Schools project began in 2018 to contribute to the achievements of ETCEP, with the goal of "developing standards for a gender sensitive approach and expanding this approach nationwide". The project was planned to span over two years, 2018 and 2019, and targeted 162 institutions in 81 provinces. However, this project was terminated due to the controversies that emerged.

The ETCEP project had been completed in 2016 but it drew some criticism in the media, where opinions against gender equity were expressed. Various media organizations published content that targeted ETCEP and other projects promoting gender equity. A press release was made on MoNE's website stating that there were no current projects on gender equity. To this date, "gender equality" content of the strategies, programs were removed.

The social policy measures that address children in poverty are not enough. There is a şack of early childhood specific social policies, thus the gap between poor children and not-poor children increases. Schools in poor neighbourhoods left only to the resources that families can create for themselves. Conditional cash transfers that are targeted for the very poor are helpful. However the amount is far from addressing the need for more comprehensive social policies. Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC) was ratified by Turkey in 1990 and it came into effect in 1995. Turkey has objections to articles 17, 29 and 30 of the convention, that are related to protecting minority cultural rights. Although,

the Lausanne Treaty grants rights to the non-Muslim minorities by protecting the right of these communities to have their own schools and education in the mother tongue; there is no similar cultural rights to the Kurdish or other population.

Although Turkey has strong legislations and regulations for some vulnerable groups, the implementation remains weak. Child poverty, child labour, and child marriage problems; gaps in accessing quality inclusive education, protection from violence and abuse continues. These gaps are particularly critical for the most vulnerable groups, including Roma children. The 2013-2017 national children's rights strategy and action plan has not been renewed and was not well monitored. Strategy for prevention of violence against children was not updated or renewed since 2018. Systematic monitoring and research on these issues remain inadequate.

Section 1: Laws and policies

What is the framework of legislation, policy and guidelines for supporting the development of an inclusive education system?

1.1 Have international/UN conventions/declarations to protect the rights of groups who are potentially vulnerable to discrimination and exclusion been integrated into national and/or regional law?

Convention/declaration on	Law	Comments
Child rights (UNCRC)	14 Sep 1990 - signed	Turkey has placed a
	04 Apr 1995 - ratified	reservation to the 17th,
		29th and 30th articles of
		the UNCRC.
Disability (UNCRPD)	30 Mar 2007 - signed	According to the 24th
	28 Sep 2009 - ratified	article of the Convention,
		states are obligated to take
		precautionary measures to
		ensure that children with
		disabilities have rights
		equal to other children, to
		acknowledge the right to
		education of those with
		disabilities, and to provide
		them full access to this
		right on all levels of the
		educational system
		without being subjected to
		any kind of discrimination.
Gender (Convention on	20 Dec 1985 - accession	CEDAW is highly
discrimination against women		controversial in Turkey.
CEDAW)		
Ethnicity or language (UN	No	
Declaration on Rights of persons		
belonging to National, ethnic,		
religious and linguistic minorities)		
Other (e.g. Rights of indigenous	No	
people)		

International Convention on the	13 Oct 1972 - signed	There is a discrimination
Elimination of All Forms of Racial	16 Sep 2002 - ratified	towards particularly to
Discrimination (CERD) (ENG)		minorities in Turkey.
United Nations International	2000 - signed	Turkey has placed a
Covenant on Civil and Political	2003 - ratified	reservation on the 27th
Rights (ICCPR) (ENG)		article of the ICCPR, which
		concerns minority groups.
		This article is related to the
		right of minority groups to
		benefit from their own
		cultures, believe in and
		practice their own
		religions, and use their own
		languages.
European Convention of Human	04 Nov. 1950 - signed	
Rights (ECHR) (ENG)	18 May 1954 - ratified	
United Nations International	2000 - signed	Although disability is not
Covenant on Economic, Social and	2003 - ratified	among the kinds of
Cultural Rights (ICESCR) (ENG)		discrimination forbidden by
		the convention, it is
		explicitly mentioned in the
		General Comment No. 5
		published by the
		Committee on Economic,
		Social and Cultural Rights
		(CESCR) – the body
		responsible for monitoring
		the implementation of the
		Covenant – that forbidding
		disability based
		discrimination is indeed
		part of the framework of
		the Covenant. This General
		Comment also emphasizes
		the right of persons with

disabilities to receive an education in an integrated environment. In its General Comment No. 13, the CESCR notes that the accessibility of education is one of the fundamental principles of the Covenant's 13th article, the article regulating the right to education. According to the Committee, there should be no de jure or de facto discrimination in education, and educational services must be both physically and economically accessible in order to achieve truly accessible education. When states party to the ICESCR disregard the special needs of children with disabilities, this is defined as discrimination by the Committee. In line with the CRC (Committee), the **CESCR** also places emphasis on the training of teachers in a manner that equips them to educate children with disabilities within the formal education system. In General Comment No. 5, where it states that persons with disabilities

must receive education in integrated environments, special emphasis is also given to the training of teachers in a manner that equips them to meet the needs of children with disabilities within regular schools that are part of the general education system, as well as to the provision of necessary equipment and support mechanisms for the education of children with disabilities. European Social Charter (ESC) 1989 - ratified European The implementation of this (ENG) and Revised European Social Social Charter Charter is monitored by the 2007 - ratified Revised Charter (RESC) (ENG) European Committee of European Social Charter Social Rights (ECSR). Although disability is not among the kinds of discrimination forbidden under the ESC or the RESC, the ECSR has declared that disability is considered to be within the scope of nondiscrimination. The ECSR emphasizes the right to equal education within general education schools and repeats that states party to the Charter must take measures to ensure this right. This Committee also declares the right of persons with disabilities to

receive equal education in regular schools and places responsibility on the states party to the Charter to take proper measures to ensure this right. The ECSR also monitors whether signatory states are transitioning from a special education model to an inclusive education model, and requests the following information from states:

- "Whether children's disabilities have been taken into account in designing the regular curriculum, and if so, in what way this has been done,
- Whether individual education plans have been prepared for students with disabilities, and how this has been done,
- Whether financial and human resources including support personnel and other technical forms of support have been made directly available to children in order to ensure their education,
- Whether any adaptation has been made in methods for evaluating the results of

education, and what kind
of adaptation this is,
Whether the diplomas
and degrees received at
the end of the educational
period are the same as
those received by other
children, and whether
these are officially
recognized".

1.2 Provide an overview of general education legislation impacting on the inclusion of learners from vulnerable groups:

Name and link	Year and status	Description of key content
	(enacted, under	
	preparation etc.)	
Constitution of the	1982, enacted	Article 42 of the Constitution of the Republic of
Republic of Turkey		Turkey provides for the right to education. It
		states that "[n]o one shall be deprived of the
		right of education" and that "[t]he scope of the
		right to education shall be defined and
		regulated by law." It also declares, "[t]he
		freedom of education does not relieve the
		individual from loyalty to the Constitution."
		Article 42 calls for education to be "based on
		contemporary scientific and educational
		principles, under the supervision and control of
		the State" and disallows the establishment of
		educational institutions that contravene these
		principles.
		Primary education, compulsory for all citizens
		of both sexes, is to be free of charge in state
		schools. Private primary and secondary
		schools are to operate by principles regulated

by law in keeping with the standards of the state schools. "The state will provide scholarships and other means of assistance to enable students of merit lacking financial means to continue their education" and will adopt measures of rehabilitation for persons in need of special education. Article 42 states that only the Turkish language will be taught to Turkish citizens at institutions of education; the foreign languages to be taught in educational institutions and the rules for education in a foreign language will be determined by law, but the provisions of international treaties are reserved. Article 24, paragraph 4, of the Turkish Constitution states, "[r]eligious and moral education and instruction shall be conducted under state supervision and control. Instruction in religious culture and morals shall be one of the compulsory lessons in the curricula of primary and secondary schools. Other religious education and instruction shall be subject to the individual's own desire, and in the case of minors, to the request of their legal representatives." 1973, enacted Article 4 guarantees the right to access to Fundamental Law of **National Education** educational institutions, regardless of people's language, race, sex and religion, and states that no privi- lege shall be given to any person, family, class or category of people in education. Article 8 states that everyone, both women and men, is guaranteed equal opportunities and means in education, and those that are lacking financial means can receive scholarships, free hostels and other

		assistance. Special measures are taken for
		children who need special education and
		protection.
The Law No.5378 for	2005, enacted	The law states that the education of persons
Persons with		with disabilities cannot be prevented on any
Disabilities		grounds whatsoever. Individuals with disability
		may prefer of the option of life-long education,
		with their difference being taken into due
		consideration, on the basis of full equality, and
		without being subjected to any form of
		discrimination. According to the law, the state
		must make the necessary planning within the
		educational system so that persons with
		disabilities are able to receive all levels of
		education,
		and take measures for the inclusion of persons
		with disabilities who, for whatever reason, have
		made a late start into formal education
		programs. The law places responsibility on the
		Ministry
		of National Education (MoNE) for the provision
		of materials such as audiobooks, or other items
		that use the sign language system or Braille
		alphabet – which may be needed by persons
		with disabilities. According to the 13th article
		of the law, measures must be taken to ensure
		that persons with disabilities are able to
		choose a profession and receive education in
		their field. The same article states that
		vocational training programs are to be
		developed through the cooperation of the
		Ministry of Labor and Social Security and
		MoNE. The law also stipulates that public
		facilities must be rendered accessible to
		persons with disabilities; and, although it is not

		explicitly mentioned in the relevant article, it is
		presumed that school buildings.
Turkish Civil Code (i.e.	2002, enacted	Parents are responsible for educating their
Law No.4721)		children and for ensuring and protecting their
		physical, mental, psychological and social
		development. Parents of children with
		disabilities must provide them "general and
		vocational education in a manner
		corresponding to their specific talents and
		dispositions." Parents of children with
		disabilities are forbidden from preventing their
		children from exercising their right to
		education.
Primary Education		The 52nd article of the Law No.222 on Primary
and Education Law		Education also requires that as part of
		compulsory primary education, parents are to
		ensure the continued attendance of their
		children in educational facilities.
Law on Private	2007, enacted	Article 2 on minority schools and special
Education Institutions		education schools

1.3 Provide an overview of education policy or guidelines impacting on inclusion of learners from vulnerable groups:

Name and link	Year and status	Description of key content
	(enacted, under	
	preparation etc.)	
Textbooks and	2012	According to Article 5 (c), textbooks cannot
Education Tools		contain discrimination based on gender, race,
Regulation		religion, language, color, political thought,
		philosophical belief, sect and similar features
		and positions.
The Pre-School and	2014	Education support rooms may also be opened
Primary Education		in pre-primary and primary education
<u>Institutions</u>		institutions in order to provide special
Regulation		education support for mainstreamed students.
		According to the regulation, "Those who have

		T
		been determined in reports by special
		education evaluation boards to have high levels
		of inability and thus be unable to receive full-
		time mainstreaming education, as well as those
		who have more than one type of impairment"
		are to be registered in special education classes
		that are to be opened if the physical conditions
		of the institution in question are suitable.
		Special education teachers must be employed
		to work in these classes.
Special Education	2018	Rights of individuals with special educational
Services Regulation		needs
Secondary Education	2013	Article 157
<u>Institutions</u>		
Regulation		
Access to Education	2014	Article 1, students who are at risk of being
by Transport		deprived of their education rights
Regulation		
Regulation on the	2002	Article 1
education of migrant		
worker children		
Open High School	2012	Right to education
Regulation		
1	İ	1

1.4 Please describe any specific plans and strategies designed to support inclusion in education (e.g. national strategy on migrant learners):

Name and link	Year and	status	Description of the focus
	(approved,	under	
	preparation e	etc.)	
Strategic Plan of	2019		Five-year goals and strategies and actions to
MoNE / 2019-2023			achieve these goals

Education Vision	2018	The 2023 Education Vision serves as the
<u>2023</u>		roadmap for Turkey's strategy to advance and
		rise in the area of education and aims that
		every single child will be able to transit from
		education to career in line with his/her
		interests, skills, and temperament and will have
		the possibility to realize his/her potential
Strategy (2016-2021)	2015, 2019	Increasing the capacities of institutions in the
and Action Plan		field of social protection, supporting the
(2019-2021) for		functioning of mechanisms and ensuring
Roma Citizens		coordination with the aim of facilitating the
		integration of Roma / disadvantaged individuals
		into society.
Teacher Strategy	2017	Yet, it is not in action
<u>Document 2017-2023</u>		
Cooperation Protocol	2018	Safety regulations
between the Ministry		
of Family, Labor and		
Social Services, the		
Ministry of Interior,		
and the Ministry of		
National Education to		
Make Schools and Its		
Environment Safer		

1.5	ls	there	а	definition	Of	inc	lusion	in e	educat	ion?	•

□ N - [□ N :	nformation		П	V
1 1 1 1 1 1	1 1 1 1	ntarmation	available		VAC

Turkey's national legislation includes a number of significant regulations regarding the rights of vulnerable groups. In particular, the Law for Persons with Disabilities passed in 2005 constitutes an important step in ensuring this right. However, in light of international human rights documents, the national legislation still has room to improve. It is important that the current emphasis in the legislation on mainstreaming/integration be gradually transformed into a framework for inclusion and inclusive education as defined in international documents. Currently, there is no framework. However, UNICEF Turkey and MoNE implement 18 different inclusive education projects. Although the list of these and their scope were not shared, several international definitions of "inclusive" education" are included in the Inclusive Education for School Leaders Project module.

"Inclusive education is not only for children who need special education, but it is also for children living in rural areas,
with different ethnic and cultural backgrounds, and girls (UNESCO, 2001)." In this sense, "inclusive education values
diversity and underlines that nobody is excluded from education due to gender, ethnic background, social class,
health, social participation and success, and thus everyone is embraced by the system (UNESCO, 2009; Ouane, 2008)."
"Inclusive education is an effort to make schools able to serve all students" within the framework of "every student is
equally important" (UNESCO, 2017; UNESCO, 1994).
1.6 Is there a definition of vulnerable groups?
No No information available Yes
Groups that require special policy or practice (disadvantaged groups): It refers to groups consisting of individuals such
as women, young people, long-term unemployed and disabled people who have more difficulties in education or
employment compared to other groups.
MoNE's 2019-2023 Strategic Plan
1.7 Is there a definition of special educational needs?
No No Information available Yes
f yes, please provide the definition and give the official source:
Individuals who show a significant difference from their peers in terms of individual and developmental characteristics
and educational competencies.
1.8 Please provide information on any future developments planned for inclusion in education.
High quality and inclusive education is among the aims shared in the
3-YEAR
CONCRETE TARGETS
Gaps across schools will begin to be closed
Schools will turn into living spaces for children
Vocational high schools will become preferable
Exam pressure will be reduced
Children will feature modern-age skills

1.9 Please provide information on any reports, evaluations and/or reviews of legislation and/or policy relating to inclusion in education, since 2015. This could include official and parallel reports on UNCRPD etc.

The professional satisfaction of teachers and school administrators will be bolstered

Children with special needs will be given the educational opportunities they deserve

Early childhood education will be expanded

Turkey is up for the third cycle of Universal Periodic Review (UPR), a process that involves reviewing the human rights records of all UN Member States. The documents submitted by Turkey and the stakeholders will be considered during the 35th session, on 28 January 2020. The documents submitted for Turkey and the stakeholders contain relevant developments in the field of education.

The National Report submitted by Turkey addresses updates and explanations on areas related to minority schools (para. 71), mandatory religion classes (para. 77, 78), elective language classes offered under the "Living Languages and Dialects" course (para. 122), revised content of education to promote inclusive education (para. 113) as well as democratic culture and human rights in schools (para. 112, 114). Also related to promoting democratic culture, the report points to trainings organized to raise awareness of the public personnel on human rights (para. 123), gender equality and violence against women (para. 130). The report also points to projects to improve technology and infrastructure, along with efforts to increase access to education in rural areas (para. 115), to provide financial support to students who have difficulties in pursuing education (para. 118), to increase girls' schooling rates (para. 116), and to increase the efficiency of the lifelong learning system and to support disadvantaged women's access to education (para.132). Regarding inclusive education, the report states that "promoting the education of persons with disabilities is among the key objectives of Turkey's education policy" (para. 118). In line with this objective, "Regulation on MNE's Special Education Services" was issued in 2018. "In 'SERÇEV Inclusive Vocational and Technical High School', where considerable planning and research were undertaken to develop the curriculum and teaching resources, 200 students with cerebral palsy are integrated with 200 of their non-disabled peers through "crossharmonization" method. SERÇEV High School was selected a "Major Award Winner" at the 2018 World Cerebral Palsy Day Awards" (para. 119). Furthermore, Paragraph 120 of the National Report states that:

"Project titled "Inclusive Education Program" is implemented by the MNE since 2015, within the scope of which braille devices capable of storing 300.000 books, including all textbooks, are distributed to schools around Turkey. Over 10.000 visually impaired students benefit from said devices each year. Another MNE project, "Inclusive Early Childhood Education for Children with Disabilities (2017-2020)", which is implemented through a close partnership with UNICEF, aims at increasing the number of children with disabilities enrolled in early childhood education by using evidence-based data to increase the awareness of families, caregivers, decision makers and community leaders about inclusive education rights. The project equips teachers, administrators and other education personnel with the essential knowledge and skills to foster inclusive education environments" (para. 120).

Another component of the UPR is the stakeholders' submissions. In the Summary of Stakeholders' submissions on Turkey it is stated that some stakeholders recommended Turkey to ratify various conventions including, but not limited to the UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education, Council of Europe Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities and other international instruments relating to minority rights, Protocol No. 12

to the European Convention on Human Rights (para. 3). Issues raised by the stakeholders in relation to right to education included closing the gender gap in secondary education, prioritizing girl's education in the rural areas, and reforming education materials and free school books with nondiscriminatory discourses in line with the CRC and UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education (para. 54). Another issue raised was the lack of access for Kurds to education in their mother tongue (para. 12).

The third component of UPR is the Compilation of Turkey. In the compilation, there were some notable concerns stated by various committees,

- UNESCO encouraged ratification of the Convention against Discrimination in Education (para. 3).
- "The Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women remained concerned about the high dropout rate and underrepresentation among girls and women in vocational training and higher education, particularly in deprived rural areas and refugee communities. The same Committee noted with concern that in parts of the south-east of Turkey, it was reported that nearly 50 per cent of girls were illiterate and even more did not continue education after primary school, given that public education was not accessible in Kurdish" (para. 46).
- "UNESCO encouraged revision of the regulatory framework to ensure at least one year of effectively free and compulsory pre-primary education, and encouraged increased availability of pre-primary education to ensure that all children, particularly refugees, could enrol" (para. 47).
- "The Committee on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities was concerned about the intersectional discrimination against and exclusion of Roma girls with disabilities, particularly from education" (para. 47).
- "The Committee on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities was concerned about the persistence of segregated education, which was discriminatory at all levels, and the absence of an inclusive education system. It recommended recognizing inclusive education in the legislation and adopting policies and strategies to implement it" (para. 59).
- "The Committee [on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities] recommended that Turkey repeal discriminatory provisions against persons with disabilities and harmonize its anti-discrimination legislation with the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities" (para. 61).

1.10 What are the perceived main challenges (barriers and hindrances) and opportunities (support and ways forward) for inclusion in education in relation to laws and policies in the country?

Although the legislation related to inclusive education is quite comprehensive, there is a considerable disconnect between the legislation and application. Moreover, the existing legislation carries greater weight in theoretical/principle aspects of inclusive education rather than the mechanisms to uphold inclusive education. The lack of clear guidelines for inclusive education practices result in inconsistent educational approaches and practices

throughout the state. Additionally, the said lack of guidance carries the potential to leave stakeholders confused in searching for legal or other type of remedies should a right violation occur.

The main challenge is the lack of overarching policy and framework on inclusive education. And the main opportunity is that there is no opposition against disability rights and children's rights.

Section 2: Governance and finance

How far are inclusive principles underpinning policies at national and local levels effectively supported by governance and financing mechanisms?

2.1 Is there formal collaboration across ministries on inclusion in education?			
☐ No ☐ No information available ☐ Yes			
If yes, in which areas does this take place and who is involved?			

Area	Yes/No	Description: what mechanism, who is involved and
		how
Policy development,	Yes	Other than education of children which MoNE is
implementation and		responsible for, the policies concerning children are
coordination		also developed by the Ministry of Health and the
		Ministry of Family, Labour and Social Services.
Identification of needs /	Yes	The Ministry of Family, Labour and Social Services is
referral for services		responsible for developing social policies that
		prevent children from being in need of protection
		and care.
Data sharing	Yes	The Ministry of Family, Labour and Social Services
		and Ministry of Interior shares data.
Monitoring and evaluation	Yes	The Intersectoral Child Council meets at least once a
		year to evaluate the country program, in agreement
		with UNICEF and the Presidency of Republic of
		Turkey Directorate of Strategy and Budget. The
		country program involves Conditional Cash Transfer
		Program and Conditional Education Assistance
		Program for Refugee Children. The council monitors
		general planning and implementation of the country
		cooperation program.
Quality assurance and	Yes	While monitoring the country cooperation program,
accountability		the Intersectoral Child Council is responsible for
		ensuring that progress is regularly reported and
		evaluated, making necessary corrections, and
		addressing the support mechanism for the country
		program.

(others)	Yes	Ministry of Ministry of Family, Labour and Social
		Services with the support of European Union funds
		conditional cash transfer for education.
If no, please give furt	her information:	
2.2 Are there shared	responsibilities bet	tween central and local governments on inclusion in education
■ No ■ No inform	ation available	Yes

2.3 Are non-governmental organisations and/or associations involved in governance processes?
☐ No ☐ No information available ☐ Yes

There is no local government in Turkey.

The involvement of the non-governmental organisations and/or associations in the governance process is limited. They can participate only if the public institutions invite them or ask their opinion. Generally, these organizations participate in workshops for policies on education of vulnerable groups organized by MoNE. Also, NGOs are invited to steering committees of inclusive education projects funded by international organizations, such as UNICEF, EU Delegation, and ECHO.

2.4 Are there any accountability mechanisms to promote the inclusion of learners from vulnerable groups
No No information available Yes

Area	Yes/No	Description of the focus/actors involved (e.g.				
		state/non state)				
Appeal process for rights violations	Yes	Since the subject of the lawsuit is children's rights, the				
		Ministry of Family, Labor and Social Services				
		intervened the lawsuit as taking the side of the				
		plaintiff.				
School inspection	Yes	MoNE is responsible for school inspections in Turkey.				
		However, it is hard to say that controlling inclusive				
		education practices in the school environment is the				
		main goal of these inspections.				
Other quality assurance processes	Yes	For the professional development of teachers on				
(e.g. standards for teaching,		inclusive education practices, MoNE provides teache				
support services etc)		training modules on inclusive education. These				
		modules can be considered as support services for				
		teachers in Turkey.				

Monitoring and evaluation (e.g.	Yes	Teachers are responsible for class-level data
data collection on attendance,		collection, such as attendance. School-level data is
participation, achievement,		collected by school principles and is sent to the district
funding)		national education directorates. District-level data is
		collected in provincial national directorates and
		provincial-level data is sent to MoNE.
(others)		

2.5 Please describe the general mechanisms for funding schools. Give details on: which institutions provide funding; what they provide; how they provide it and to whom, which mechanisms they use to allocate resources; and their respective roles and responsibilities.

Funding mechanisms	Description of who, what, to whom and how
Central funding	MoNE sends the budget to schools. The budget is determined on the basis
	of the number of students and previous year's expenditure. In this funding
	scheme, school administrations have limited authority on budget setting.
	Changing the central funding framework is part of MoNE's 2023 strategy.
	MoNE planning to give more resources to disadvantaged schools. Also,
	increasing flexibility of budget setting by giving more power to school
	administrations is a part of 2023 strategy.
Self-funding	Since central funding is limited, school administrations look for additional
	funds. Most schools create additional funds via school-parents
	associations. In addition to donations, school-parents association can
	generate funds by renting school's parking lots, multipurpose halls and
	gyms.

2.6 Do schools have flexibility to use funding allocations to support the inclusion of learners from vulnerable groups
■ No ■ No information available ■ Yes
The budget allocation is centralized in Turkey.

2.7 Please describe the specific mechanisms for funding the inclusion of vulnerable learners and their families in education (e.g. benefits, cash transfers, scholarships). Give details on: which institutions provide funding; what they provide; how they provide it and to whom, which mechanisms they use to allocate resources; and their respective roles and responsibilities.

Funding mechanisms	Description of the who, what, to whom and how
--------------------	---

Scholarships	MoNE gives scholarships to socioeconomically disadvantaged		
	students in primary and secondary education. Students whose		
	household income is below a certain amount can take the "Primary		
	and Secondary Educational Institutions Scholarship Exam".		
	According to the number of available places for the year, the most		
	successful students can get the scholarship in the form of monetary		
	benefit or benefit from school housing. The information about		
	"Primary and Secondary Educational Institutions Scholarship Exam		
	2020" can be found at:		
	http://www.meb.gov.tr/meb_iys_dosyalar/2020_02/03135736_202		
	O IOKBS Basvuru ve Uygulama Kilavuzu.pdf		
Conditional Cash Transfer	UNICEF, MoNE, Ministry of Ministry of Family, Labour and Social		
for Education Program	Services and Turkish Red Crescent is the carry out of the program,		
	funded by ECHO. The program aims to improve the enrollment rate		
	of Syrian children and other refugee groups. Other than refugees,		
	socioeconomically disadvantaged students in Turkey also benefit		
	from other conditional cash transfers for education programs,		
	executed by the Ministry of Ministry of Family, Labour and Social		
	Services. The recipients of the cash benefit is determined by the		
	Integrated Social Assistance Information System. The information		
	about the program can be found at:		
	https://www.unicef.org/turkey/en/conditional-cash-transfer-		
	education-ccte-programme		

2.8 Please provide information (main conclusions, reference and a link if available) on any recent reports, evaluations and/or reviews, since 2015 of funding and resourcing relating to inclusive education.

<u>Conditional cash transfers in Turkey: A case to reflect on the AKP's approach to gender and social policy by Meltem</u>
<u>Yılmaz Şener</u>

This paper discusses "the gender aspect of social policy provision in Turkey during the Justice and Development Party" (AKP) with a focus on conditional cash transfers. AKP implemented this a poverty alleviation programme.

Combating Social Inequalities in Turkey through Conditional Cash Transfers (CCT)? by Christian Bergmann, Mine Tafolar

The article focuses on CCTs that aims to have helped to diminish social inequalities in Turkey by concentrating on three crucial areas of interest: gender inequalities, transition to labour market as well as regional imbalances.

2.9 Overall, what are the perceived main challenges (barriers and hinderances) and opportunities (support and ways forward) for inclusion in education in relation to governance and finance issues in the country?

There are few resources on funding and resourcing relating to inclusive education in Turkey since the information on public funds for inclusive education is limited. Other than conditional cash transfers, the share of the spending inclusive education in MoNE's budget is not shared publicly. Only international organizations' spending on inclusive education can be monitored.

There are many stakeholders in policy debates on inclusive education in Turkey. From NGOs to international organizations, different institutions work on inclusive education. Especially parents of children with special needs create advocacy organizations for disabilities. With international organizations' involvement in funding refugee education, quality of data accumulated about refugee education is increased. Compared to the past, these stakeholders have a strong impact on the decision-making process, which makes governance of inclusive education more transparent. In addition to this, with MoNE's new strategy, Turkey's Education Vision 2023, the ministry aims to increase the involvement of different stakeholders in policy debates. Since 2018, there have been positive developments in terms of stakeholders' involvement. More NGOs from different backgrounds were invited to meetings of MoNE, and feedback about ongoing policies was requested from them.

Section 3: Data

What data on inclusion in education is available to understand if progress is being made towards equitable learning opportunities for all learners?

3.1 Please indicate if the following frameworks are in place, provide a link and give a brief description of their aims and focus:

Framework	Yes	/	Description
	No		
For monitoring and	Yes		The information on outputs of the monitoring and
evaluating the			evaluation process is not shared by MoNE with the public, so
implementation of			that the information on the ministry's effort for monitoring
national-level			and evaluating the implementation of national-level
inclusion in			inclusion in education policy is not available. On the other
education policy			hand, for the projects funded externally by organizations
			such as UNICEF, EU Delegation or ECHO, it is shared with the
			public. Almost every project has steering committees to
			supervise tje monitoring and evaluation process. Executive
			teams of these projects are responsible for sharing outputs
			with the steering committees. In addition to public

		institutions and funding organizations, NGOs can also be
		members of steering committees.
For quality assurance	Yes	School Profile Evaluation Model is a model presented in the
across all levels of		ministry's <u>2023 Education Vision</u> .
the system (national,		"The development of all our schools will be monitored,
regional, school)		evaluated, and supported through the School Profile
		Evaluation Model to be configured for all levels of education.
		The structure, roles, and responsibilities of provincial and
		sub- provincial offices of the Ministry of National Education
		will be restructured to enhance monitoring and support to
		the development of schools. In summary, all processes
		undergone by schools will be monitored, and their progress
		will be evaluated within the schools' own context."
Providing guidance	Yes	Student Achievement Monitoring Survey is a model
on the use of a range		presented in the ministry's 2023 Education Vision.
of different data		"A Student Achievement Monitoring Survey will be
sources for		conducted to see how the system and the decisions work at
evaluation and self-		the defined grade levels based on the academic output of
review at different		students and without use of any scoring."6
levels (national,		
regional, school)		

3.2 What data is collected on learners from vulnerable groups, how and why?

The vulnerable groups in the education system of Turkey are including but not limited to girls, refugee children, children whose native language is not Turkish, socioeconomically disadvantaged children and children with special education needs. The data about these groups are not available separately most of the time. The data is collected under the three main categories:

- Enrolment: MoNE collects the data via the e-school system, used by teachers and school principles.
 Information on Syrian students and other refugee groups is also in this system. But the enrollment rates of refugees are shared separately.
 - Resource for enrolment rate of all students, including girls and children with special education needs (only number of student with special needs is shared): National Education Statistics Formal
 Education

⁶ http://2023vizyonu.meb.gov.tr/doc/2023_VIZYON_ENG.pdf p. 35

https://sgb.meb.gov.tr/meb iys dosyalar/2019 09/30102730 meb istatistikleri orgun egitim 201 8 2019.pdf

- Resource for enrolment rate of refugees: Data shared by MoNE General Directorate of Lifelong
 Learning Migration and Emergency Education Department
 https://hbogm.meb.gov.tr/meb_iys_dosyalar/2019_11/06141131_11Ekim2019internetBulteni.pdf
- Learning achievement: In addition to PISA and TIMSS data, MoNE designed two assessment programs to evaluate student performance. The first program called "Monitoring and Evaluation of Academic Skills" (ABİDE) consists of multiple-choice and open-ended questions in Turkish, mathematics, science and social studies. 4th-grade and 8th- grade students participate in this program. Another assessment program called "Research for Student Achievement Monitoring" consists of open-ended questions for 10th-grade students, and questions based on knowledge, practice and reasoning for 4th-grade and 7th-grade students. The data of both assessments is collected via a sample survey. General results of the assessment programs are shared with the public, but not the microdata. The data of in-class exams is also collected by MoNE, but it is not shared with the public.
 - O Website of "Monitoring and Evaluation of Academic Skills" (ABİDE): http://abide.meb.gov.tr
 - Report on Research for Student Achievement (Turkish, Math and Science, 4th Grade):
 https://www.meb.gov.tr/meb iys dosyalar/2019 09/23150323 TMF-OBAI-4-2019 Rapor9.pdf
- Learner outcomes: After secondary education, students have to take the university entrance exam to continue their education in the university. Measuring, Selection and Placement Center in Turkey shares the exam results. Also, MoNE has the data for primary and secondary education graduates.
 - O The latest data on university entrance exam results: https://www.osym.gov.tr/TR,16889/2019-yks-yerlestirme-sonuclarina-iliskin-sayisal-bilgiler.html
 - Data on primary and secondary education graduates: National Education Statistics Formal Education
 https://sgb.meb.gov.tr/meb_iys_dosyalar/2019_09/30102730_meb_istatistikleri_orgun_egitim_201_8_2019.pdf
- 3.3 Please provide the available data relating to all learners in the compulsory education system and where they are enrolled for their education.

Data on learner access to compulsory	Learners	Notes	Source
education			
(i) What is the potential population of	Total: 15,185,548		Turkish
learners for the compulsory education	Male: 7,797,806		Statistical
system in the country (i.e. how many	Female:		Institute,
children are in the country that should,	7,387,742		Data on
by law, be in some form of compulsory			Population
education)?			

			by Year of
			Birth, 2018
(ii) How many learners are enrolled in all	Total: 18,108,860	Only authority	MoNE,
forms of education (i.e. educational	Male: 9,394,125	that is	National
settings maintained by the ministry of	Female:	responsible for	Education
education or by other authorities such as	8,714,735	the K12	Statistics
health, welfare or labour ministries)?		education in	Formal
		Turkey is MoNE	Education,
			2019
(iii) How many learners are out of any	Total: 769,939	This data shows	MoNE,
form of education (who by law should	Male: 377,044	an approximate	National
be in some form of education)?	Female: 392,666	number of	Education
		learners who	Statistics
		are out of any	Formal
		form of	Education,
		education. The	2019 and
		number was	Turkish
		calculated by	Statistical
		using the net	Institute,
		enrollment	Data on
		rates and	Population
		population by	by Year of
		age data.	Birth, 2018
(iv) How many learners are enrolled in	Total: M	The data can be	MoNE
mainstream schools (i.e. all learners, not	Male: M	collected by	
just those with recognised needs or from	Female: M	MoNE, but it is	
vulnerable groups)?		not shared with	
		the public.	
(v) How many learners are enrolled in	Total: 295,697	The data	MoNE,
mainstream schools and spend the	Male: 186,953	includes	National
majority of their time (i.e. at least 80%	Female: 108,744	students who	Education
or 4 days of the week) in inclusive		have special	Statistics
groups/classes with their peers?		education	Formal
		needs.	Education,
			2019

(vi) How many learners are enrolled in	Total: 49,304	The data	MoNE,
mainstream schools and spend the	Male: 31,411	includes	National
majority of their time (i.e. at least 80%	Female: 17,893	students who	Education
or 4 days of the week) in separate,		have special	Statistics
special groups/classes, away from their		education	Formal
peers?		needs.	Education,
			2019
(vii) How many learners are enrolled in	Total: 13,245	The data	MoNE,
totally separate, special units and/or	Male: 8,556	includes	National
schools, away from their peers?	Female: 4,689	students who	Education
		have special	Statistics
		education	Formal
		needs.	Education,
			2019

3.4 Please provide information (main conclusions, reference and a link if available) on any recent reports, evaluations and/or reviews, since 2015 of data collection and monitoring for inclusion in education.

Education Reform Initiative, TEDMEM, and Eğitim Bir-Sen publish annual education monitoring reports. In all of these reports, there is a special chapter for the governance in education. Also, the publicly shared yearly data can be found in these reports.

- Education Reform Initiative Education Monitoring Reports
- TEDMEM Education Assessment Reports
- Eğitim Bir-Sen Education Overview: Monitoring and Evaluation Reports

3.5 Overall, what are the perceived main challenges (barriers and hinderances) and opportunities (support and ways forward) for inclusion in education in relation to data collection issues in the country?

The lack of data on inclusive education is the main challenge in Turkey. Although the number of students with special needs is shared with the public, the total number of children with special needs is not known. For the data on refugee students, it is hard to get additional information from the Ministry other than the data shared with the public. However, the detailed data is shared with international organizations, stakeholders of MoNE on refugee education, like UNICEF.

According to the new strategy of the MoNE, called <u>Turkey's Education Vision 2023</u>, a school-level data-based planning and management system, a learning analytics platform, and Educational Data Warehouse will be introduced in 2020. Educational Data Warehouse will consist of all data collected by MoNE. The learning analytics platform will analyze the data accumulated in MoNE for "the school performance assessments, identification of teachers' professional

development needs, measurement of curriculum efficiency, and analysis of physical capacity and person With these developments, more detailed data on inclusive education can be generated and shared with	
The firese developments, more detailed data on moldsive education surface generated and shared with	the public.

Section 4: Curricula, learning materials and assessments

To what extent are curricula, learning materials and different assessment processes and procedures adapted to the principles of inclusive education?

4.1 Curriculum
a. Does the curriculum content include and represent all learners?
■ No ■ No information available ■ Partially ■ Yes
There are many levels of this issue: Gender, multilingual, multicultural, etc. Currently, the curriculum does not include
all cultural & minority groups, all religions, sects and beliefs. MoNE is responsible from the preparation of the
curriculum. Curriculum is highly controversial in Turkey that also leads polarization within the society. All ruling parties
changed the curriculum and integrated their ideology. It is currently "values education" with a background of religion
education. Curriculum is not inclusive for minorities, and problematic in the areas of gender, religion, class, region
and ethnicity.
Some of the critical literature that can elaborate the situation further are as follows:
 https://tr.boell.org/en/2019/10/01/constructing-new-turkey-through-education
• http://turkishpolicy.com/article/956/turkeys-progress-on-gender-equality-in-education-rests-on-gender-
<u>politics</u>
• https://www.researchgate.net/publication/328413717 Secularism and Gender in Turkey%27s New Text
books_Research_Executive_Summary
 Citizenship Education in Turkey: From Militant-Secular to Islamic Nationalism (Sen & Starkey, 2020)
 http://www.ctad.hacettepe.edu.tr/14 27/07.pdf
 https://link.springer.com/chapter/10.1057/9781137097811_5
 http://en.egitimreformugirisimi.org/inclusive-education-study-2/
http://www.egitimreformugirisimi.org/wp-
content/uploads/2017/03/ERG_KapsayiciEgitim_PolitikaOnerileri.pdf
b. Does the process of curriculum development involve the participation and contribution of different stakeholders?
No No information available Yes
Only partially. There is no evidence on identifying the contributions of different stakeholders. Ministry of Nationa
Education prepares the curriculum. The education program which was based on constructivist approach has been

replaced by the program implemented in the 1st, 5th and 9th grade classrooms in 2017-2018 academic year. As of

today, all grades are implementing the new curricula. On February 2017, the new curricula were announced and feedback from teachers and NGOS, academia requested. However only 20 days were given. Hundreds of thousands

of teachers were consulted during the preparation of the program, NGOs and academicians shared their feedbacks. Yet, the final curricula were almost the same as the one that was announced.

https://www.egitimreformugirisimi.org/yayin/ergnin-meb-taslak-ogretim-programlari-inceleme-ve-degerlendirmesi/

c. Is there guidance/procedures for schools to ensure that the curriculum content takes account of all learners (e.g.
using flexibility to address differences due to gender, culture, religions, the ethnicities/nations living in the country,
their history and culture, differences related to disability and socio-economic background, LGBT community).
■ No ■ No information available ■ Yes
Partially. Education legislation, in line with the international standards, stresses taking all learners into account while
planning teaching and learning processes. However, this is not the case in practice. Often, inclusive education is
understood synonymous to mainstreaming, leaving aside various other aspects of inclusive education practices and
various vulnerable groups.
Exception is the Special Needs area. The legislations are strong in Turkey, yet the facilities of the schools and teacher
preparedness needs to be strengthened.
http://www.egitimdebirlikteyiz.org/CmsFiles/Materyaller/5/egitici_egitimi.pdf
Some of the critical literature that can elaborate the situation further are as follows:

http://en.egitimreformugirisimi.org/inclusive-education-study-2/

http://www.egitimreformugirisimi.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/03/ERG_KapsayiciEgitim_PolitikaOnerileri.pdf

http://secbir.org/tr/yayinlar/30-turkce/yay-nlar-m-z/255-engellilik-ve-ayrimcilik

http://secbir.org/tr/calismalar/projelerimiz

http://www.egitimreformugirisimi.org/egitim-gozlemevi/izleme/

d. If individual education plans (IEPs) are used, please describe the procedure for developing (who is involved and how), what they focus on (specific curriculum areas; cross curricular competences; support strategies etc.) and how IEPs are implemented, used across the school.

As mentioned by Sart (2016) in Education Reform Initiative's report (link is below):

"After completing the diagnostic process, the individualized education plan (IEP) preparation process defined in the legislation should be structured and set in motion in accordance with the child's special needs. This plan's designated outcomes should be described in detail and delivered in both the short term and the long term. The individualized teaching plan (ITP) also includes the educational goals prepared in line with short term purposes. Led by the principal/vice principal, the IEP team should develop this program by consulting the opinion of parents, together with form teachers, if the student is in the preliminary stage, and with subject matter teachers, psychological counselors as well as special education teachers (if the school has them), if the student is in the later stages of their education.

But in Turkey, school counsellors usually had to carry out this process on their own. Opinions of the parents may not be taken throughout the IEP process. Just as lesson plans for basic education can typically be prepared using resources from the Internet, IEPs too are mostly downloaded from the Internet."

http://en.egitimreformugirisimi.org/wp-

content/uploads/2017/03/UnicefOzelGereksinimliRaporENG.08.06.16.web .pdf

e. Are there different curricula or programmes for specific groups of learners at risk of exclusion (e.g. ethnic minorities
or minority language groups)
No No information available Yes
Partly. Only for the Special Needs Education.
The Current State of Textbooks in Turkey: a denial of minorities:
https://gemreportunesco.wordpress.com/2017/01/09/8971/
http://secbir.org/en/publications

MoNE Special Education and Counseling Services General Directorate is responsible for the special education curriculum. Currently, the <u>curriculum programs</u> available are:

- Early Childhood Special Education Curriculum for 0-36 months
- Preschool Special Education Curriculum for 37-78 months
- Training School for Special Education (I. Grade) (link to the curriculum compilation)
- Training School for Special Education (II. Grade) (<u>link to the curriculum compilation</u>)
- Training School for Special Education (III. Grade) (link to the curriculum compilation)
- Curriculum for Physical Education, Sports and Independent Movement Course for Visually Impaired Students (<u>link to the curriculum compilation</u>)
- Academic Curriculum for Special Education of Vocational High School (Light Levels of Educable Mentally Imparied) (link to the curriculum compilation)
- Vocational Curriculum for Special Education of Vocational High School (Visually Impaired)
- Academic Curriculum for Special Education of Vocational High School (Visually Impaired)
- Social Cohesion Skills Course Curriculum for Light Levels of Educable Mentally Imparied
- Support Education Programs
- Turkish Sign Language Course Curriculum for Hearing-impaired Primary School (Grades 1, 2, and 3)

In addition to the special education curriculum, the National Report submitted by Turkey for UPR states that "students belonging to non-Muslim minorities are able to attend minority schools where they can learn about their culture and language while taking classes that are part of the national curriculum. As of 2018-2019 school year, 59 minority schools, ranging from kindergartens to high schools, carry out their educational activities". In the same document, it is stated that "elective classes are offered under the "Living Languages and Dialects" course. In addition to Kurdish (Kurmanji and Zazaki), Circassian (Adige and Abkhaz) and Laz, public schools started offering Albanian and Bosnian

course in the 2016-2017 and 2017-2018 school years was 67.144 and 47.624, respectively. The MoNE also carries out Intervention Program in Primary Schools (IYEP) (video 1, video 2) in collaboration with UNICEF and Adjustment Classes (Uyum Sınıfları) for students whose native language is not Turkish in collaboration with PICTES. 4.2 Learning materials a. Is there autonomy for schools and teachers to select learning material/textbooks etc? No No information available Yes Turkey is highly centralized. The textbooks are produced by the Ministry of Education and distributed to the schools. https://www.meb.gov.tr/2017-2018-egitim-ve-ogretim-yilinda-okutulacak-ilkokul-ortaokul-ve-lise-derskitaplari/duyuru/14472 http://www.eba.gov.tr/arama?q=ders%20kitaplari https://gemreportunesco.wordpress.com/2017/01/09/8971/ b. Are there policies to ensure the availability of textbooks/materials that promote the inclusion of learners from different vulnerable groups? (e.g. resources relevant to different ethnic groups etc.) **No** No information available Yes Partly. The National Report submitted by Turkey for UPR states that a "project titled "Inclusive Education Program" is implemented by the MoNE since 2015, within the scope of which braille devices capable of storing 300.000 books, including all textbooks, are distributed to schools around Turkey. Over 10.000 visually impaired students benefit from said devices each year". http://www.mfa.gov.tr/data/ENFORMASYON/duyurular/upr-national-report.pdf The textbooks and materials are produced and distributed by the MoNE. The legislation concerning education asserts that the necessary textbooks and materials should be provided to the students. However, it is unclear whether each child in need of specialized textbooks and materials have access to them or not. https://www.meb.gov.tr/2017-2018-egitim-ve-ogretim-yilinda-okutulacak-ilkokul-ortaokul-ve-lise-derskitaplari/duyuru/14472 http://www.eba.gov.tr/arama?q=ders%20kitaplari c. Is there guidance/procedures to help schools to make learning materials accessible for all learners? (e.g. Braille/large print for learners with visual impairment, materials in other languages). No No information available Yes The experts in the field argue that there are no national guidelines regarding creating accessible materials. However, MoNE encourage teachers to create learning materials through competitions such as Special Materials for Special

classes in the 2017-2018 school year. Number of students that took classes under the "Living Languages and Dialects"

competition.
d. Is ICT used to improve access to materials for vulnerable groups?
No No information available Yes
Educational Informatics Network (EBA) is an online platform launched and improved by the MoNE, consisting of
education material, videos, resources for distance education and catch-up training accessible by students, teachers
and parents. EBA can be used by all teachers, students and parents. There are materials for special needs, refugees,
catch-up classes for disadvantaged children who fall behind their peers.
https://www.eba.gov.tr/eba-sinif-bazli.html
e. Are there specific financial and practical resources available for textbooks/materials/ICT for different vulnerable
groups?
No ☐ No information available ☐ Yes
The textbooks are produced by the Ministry of Education and distributed to the schools.
https://www.meb.gov.tr/2017-2018-egitim-ve-ogretim-yilinda-okutulacak-ilkokul-ortaokul-ve-lise-ders-
kitaplari/duyuru/14472
http://www.eba.gov.tr/arama?q=ders%20kitapları
https://gemreportunesco.wordpress.com/2017/01/09/8971/
4.3 Assessment
a. Is there a national/local assessment framework that includes all learners?
No ☐ No information available ☐ Yes
A <u>School Development Model</u> as part of the <u>Turkey's Education Vision 2023</u> was "established through which all who
are involved in children's learning will take part in the school improvement activities." MoNE aims this for systemwide
improvement, thus they put schools needs on front. For MoNE "schools pursue specific objectives in line with the
priorities of the education system and of their respective provinces, districts, and neighborhoods and organize
activities tailored to achieve these objectives." School Development Model will target to help "schools improve
allowed as to Proceedings of the control of the con

<u>Children</u>. On a yearly basis, teachers that produce special needs materials for schools/classes they can submit to the

activities tailored to achieve these objectives." School Development Model will target to help "schools improve themselves in line with the national education policies and objectives, taking into consideration their respective conditions and priorities." It will be prepared based on each school profile, which then will show a roadmap in "which progress will be evaluated each year at local and central levels." Each student's "academic and social development will be monitored, evaluated, supported and improved individually." It is aimed that this model will be based on improvement, rather than competition. By monitoring students, schools will be monitored, evaluated, supported and improved via School Profile Evaluation Model.

b. Is there guidance for teachers on how to use curriculum-based assessment to identify all learning needs in the
classroom?
■ No ■ No information available ■ Yes
But MoNE's new Education Vision 2023 will target this aim. As MoNE shares, this assessment will be implemented via
the School Development Model mentioned above. In addition to that "Learning Analytics Platform, which is to be
established will be used to evaluate all processes, including the school performance assessments, identification of
teachers' professional development needs, measurement of curriculum efficiency, and analysis of physical capacity
and personnel needs."
c. Is there guidance/procedures on providing access to tests/examinations when learners need additional
support/reasonable adjustments? (e.g. adapted materials, extra time etc.)
No No information available Yes
There are no national guidelines/procedures on all learners in the classroom. However, in some
handbooks/curriculums that are designed for special education there might be chapters titled "assessment and
evaluation," where the teachers are advised to use diverse methods to assess learners with various backgrounds.
Nevertheless, the recommendations are not supported by concrete examples or specific guidelines on how to diversify
assessment methods.
d. Are there specific arrangements and/or formal procedures to support the assessment of the specific needs of
learners who need additional support in their learning? (e.g. those with disabilities)
■ No ■ No information available ■ Yes
There are no national guidelines/procedures. In some handbooks/curriculums that are designed for special education
there are chapters titled "assessment and evaluation," where the teachers are advised to use diverse methods to
assess learners with various backgrounds. Nevertheless, the recommendations are not supported by concrete
examples or specific guidelines on how to diversify assessment methods.
e. Is ICT used in the assessment of vulnerable groups?
No No information available Yes
- -
Recently a <u>School Development Model</u> was established which targets to assess particularly vulnerable groups. Please
see 4.3.a.
4.4 Please provide information (main conclusions, reference and a link if available) on any recent reports, studies,
evaluations and/or reviews, since 2015 relating to issues around curricula, learning materials and assessment

processes.

"The major developments that transpired during the 2015-16 school year are evaluated under three main areas: governance and financing, access to education and quality of education. The topics covered include education in the new key policy documents, education expenditures; private education institutions; access to education; pre-primary education policies; the distribution of secondary education students under different types of programs; the education of children with special needs and Syrian refugee children; teacher appointments; the candidate teacher program, as well as other developments involving the quality and the content of education."

Education Monitoring Report 2015-16 (ERG) (ENG)

Education Monitoring Report 2016-17 (ERG) (ENG)

The following document summarizes the important steps that need to be taken for inclusive education to become a policy priority in Turkey.

Policy Recommendations For Promoting Inclusive Education in Turkey (ERG) (2016) (ENG)

The following reports is "on a study that examined to what extent children with disabilities (aged 0-18) are able to access education in Turkey, the scope and quality of educational services provided, the needs of children and their families and the problems they experience. The aim was to identify problem areas in the field of education in order to create a basis for policy recommendations in this field. In examining the extent to which children with disabilities can realize their right to education, the study incorporated the opinions of children with disabilities, their parents, teachers and psychological counselors in schools, experts working in counseling and research centers, school administrators, and experts working in special education and rehabilitation centers."

The Right of Children with Disabilities to Education: Situation Analysis and Recommendations for Turkey (ERG) (2016) (ENG)

The following report presents" the data gathered through one-on-one interviews conducted with eleven minority school and public-school teachers. The only common characteristic of the teachers chosen is that they have given thought to how an inclusive education construct may actually be realized and have made an effort to shape their daily teaching practices through such an understanding. The study seeked answers to the following two research questions:

- 1. What kinds of opportunities do teachers create to enable inclusive education practices?
- 2. What are the needs expressed by teachers for making inclusive education possible?"

Inclusive Education: School Practices, Teachers' Needs (ERG) (2016) (ENG)

The report below is "comprised of three main sections. The first section is an examination of national and international legislation in order to delineate the legal basis of inclusive education. The second section is a literature review regarding inclusive education. This section also includes good examples of inclusive education from across the world. The third section is a data-based evaluation of the state of inclusive education in Turkey."

A Situation Analysis of Inclusive Education in Secondary Schools in Turkey (ERG) (2016) (ENG)

The following materials are alternative materials to struggle disability discrimination in educational settings. They include alternative lesson plans and teacher's guidebook.

ENGELLİLİĞE VE CİNSİYETE DAYALI AYRIMCILIK İlk ve Ortaöğretim Kurumları için Örnek Ders Uygulamaları (SEÇBİR) (2015) (TUR)

Engellilik ve Ayrımcılık: Eğitimciler için Temel Metinler ve Örnek Dersler (SEÇBİR) (2015) (TUR) Engellilik ve Ayrımcılık: Eğitimciler için El Kitapçığı (SEÇBİR) (2015) (TUR)

The following reports includes the definition of autism spectrum disorder, the features of autism spectrum disorder, current diagnostic criteria and processes, the legal regulations regarding special education in Turkey, best practices related to children with autism, after-school life and family support systems.

<u>Teacher Training and Education Presentation Report for Autism Spectrum Disorders in Turkey, 2019</u> (Tohum Otizm) (TUR)

Children with Autism Spectrum Disorders in Turkey and Integration Report, 2019 (Tohum Otizm) (TUR)

Autism Spectrum Disorder and Special Education Report 2017 (Tohum Otizm) (TUR)

Special Needs Education Portal in Turkey by MoNE: <u>Curriculum and Materials</u> (ORGM) (TUR)

4.5 Overall, what are the perceived main challenges (barriers and hinderances) and opportunities (support and ways forward) for inclusion in education in relation to curricula, learning materials and assessment processes in the country?

The concept of "inclusive education" is becoming increasingly prominent in Turkey in the recent years. This context presents opportunities and challenges.

The first opportunity is related to the Syrian children in Turkey: Turkey is host to 3,671,553 school aged Syrian children who have been gradually included in the national education system. Furthermore, Turkey presents a unique case as the ages of children to be integrated in the national education system vary. Research and projects conducted on

inclusive education practices for refugee and migrant children, as well as attempts to create models for inclusive education in situations of mass migration can be valuable contributions to literature and the education field as a whole.

Another opportunity lies in the reform endeavors. the Minister of National Education, Prof. Ziya Selçuk, announced the 2023 Education Vision in November 2018 and "New Upper Secondary Design" in April 2019. Inclusive education was emphasized in relation to increasing access to education and restructuring the services in the 2023 Education Vision, which mostly concerned learners with special needs and learners with special talents. Moreover, Prof. Selçuk announced significant structural changes in the upper secondary education system, as well as the education content. The courses are announced to be more interdisciplinary and flexible, which would potentially allow adjusting the teaching and learning processes according to the needs of different learners. In addition, there were talks of reforming the university entrance procedure, which is a national standardized test currently, to involve more variables and allow the candidates to express their skills and competencies in different ways. There are currently no announced plans to change the university entrance system but if such a change happens, it would relieve students of having to spend years on a very rigid process such as mastering standardized test taking and allow them to focus on their individual strengths. Most of the announced changes are still in planning, and it is not yet possible to offer a comprehensive evaluation of the policies.

In addition the above stated opportunities to improve inclusive education practices in Turkey, there are some challenges to achieve inclusive education. Firstly, education legislation, in line with the international standards, stresses taking all learners into account while planning teaching and learning processes. However, this is not the case in reality. Often, inclusive education is understood synonymous to mainstreaming, leaving aside various other inclusive education practices and various vulnerable groups. Inclusive education is concerned with responding to the needs of all learners who might need special assistance including, but not limited to, refugees, individuals with disabilities, LGBTQI+ individuals. On the other hand mainstreaming aims to regulate teaching to facilitate learning. As long as the terms are used interchangeably and without distinction it can be an obstacle to create specific guidelines and strategies to meaningfully include all learners in the teaching and learning process.

A related challenge concerns the MoNE's strategy around inclusive education. Although mainstreaming is still the preferred method, the MoNE also opens special education schools or special education classes within existing schools. Opening schools and classes is important to increase access to education but it should be done without compromising the quality of education. For example, both regular schools and schools for students with special needs do not have "education coordinators" to manage the education processes, design teaching, learning and assessment that would be appropriate for the needs and skills of diverse learners. As a result, it is not possible to assess the success of the teaching and learning process in assisting the learners gain the necessary skills, and thus not possible to detect areas that require improvement.

There should also be standards regulating special education schools that include the size of the school, the types of trainings offered, the types of learners that the school caters to, as well as specific qualifications of the teachers/educators, such as the schools graduated, certificates received and areas of teaching. The need for

evaluation and assessment of the education system regarding special education appears crucial, as it is not possible to create standards and draft regulations without knowing the need areas.

Another challenge is related to the initial teacher training and curriculum. Inclusive education is often seen as closely related to the education of learners with special needs, rather than all learners. As a result, inclusive education methods and practices are offered in teachers colleges as elective courses. In a context where inclusive education practices in classrooms are carried out through individual efforts of the education personnel, most do not feel competent in exercise their training in real life situations. Inclusive education practices should not only be an integral part of initial teacher training, but there should also be a continuous effort to provide teachers with the necessary resources, training, materials and guidance once they are in service. Another aspect is related to the personal opinions of the educational personnel and their conduct. It is important for teachers to internalize the philosophy of inclusive education, along with the specific practices that they can use in the classroom.

Section 5: Teachers and support personnel

How are staff in schools prepared to accommodate students of all abilities and backgrounds, in terms of their initial training, continuing professional development and their attitudes to inclusion?

5.1 Please list type of staff, their numbers and required level of education for the position in different type of educational institutions

Type of staff	Number	Required	Comment
		education	
Mainstream schools			
Teachers	1.077.30	"Initial	TALIS 2018 reflects
	7	teacher	that there is a need
		training	for initial and in-
		programs for	service teacher
		pre-primary	training on special
		education,	needs and for class
		primary	with diverse
		education,	backgrounds.
		and secondary	
		education in	
		Turkey are	
		carried out by	
		the	
		universities"	
		and through	
		faculties of	
		education that	
		last four	
		years. There	
		is also	
		Pedagogic	
		Formation	
		Training	
		Programs for	
		the graduates	
		of other	
		programs	

		(Faculty of	
		Sciences,	
		Languages,	
		etc.).	
		Programs of	
		teacher	
		education is	
		implemented	
		under the	
		Higher	
		Education	
		Council.	
Professional staff (psychologists,	M	Degree in	The data is not
pedagogues, social pedagogues, speech	IVI	Guidance and	shared with the
and other types of therapists)		Psychological	public.
and other types of therapists)		Counseling, or	public.
		psychology,	
		social	
		services, or	
		special	
		education.	
Teacher Assistants (specify role and add	N/A		
rows as required)			
Others (please specify and add rows as			
required)			
Special schools	1		
Teachers	14.043	Degree in in	
		Special	
		Education	
Professional staff (psychologists,	М	Degree in	The data is not
pedagogues, social pedagogues, speech		Guidance and	shared with the
and other types of therapists)	1	Psychological	public.
		1 Sychological	, , , , ,
		Counseling, or	

1	T	
	social	
	services, or	
	special	
	education.	
N/A		
kist (i.e. chile	dren's homes, you	ung offenders
N/A		The data is not
		shared with the
		public.
N/A		The data is not
		shared with the
		public.
N/A		The data is not
		shared with the
		public.
	N/A N/A	services, or special education. N/A xist (i.e. children's homes, you N/A N/A

 $5.2\ Please\ indicate\ if\ education/training\ on\ inclusion\ in\ education\ is\ available\ for\ the\ following\ groups\ of\ professionals.$

Type of staff	Yes	No	No inform- ation	If yes please state if pre- or in-service, mandatory or optional, who provides education/training and summary of content
Head teachers/School directors	Υ			In-service, MoNE
Teachers	Υ			In-service, MoNE
Teacher Assistants			NI	
Professional Staff			NI	
Inspectors			NI	
Teacher Trainers	Υ			In-service, MoNE
Others (please list add rows as required)				

Within the 3RP framework, UNICEF is the largest partner for MoNE. They run 18 different inclusive education projects. But the full list is not shared. However, with support from UNICEF, Turkey started teacher trainings on inclusive education in Turkey. As part of projects done in collaboration with MoNE and UNICEF, an inclusive education training was delivered to 105.512 teachers who have foreign children in their classrooms. The project was developed into a more diverse 10 module training for inclusive education, in collaboration with Erciyes University, including special modules on children with special needs, children who survived violence, learning turkish as a second language, working with refugee children, in order to support teachers with their more specific challenges.

a. If you answered no to any of the above, please provide further information:

N/A

5.3 Is education and training of teachers aligned with national policy goals on inclusive education?

No No information available Yes

There is no national policy goal and framework for inclusive education yet. But MoNE's new Education Vision 2023 aims for inclusive pedagogy. There are some courses focusing on special education, mainstreaming, and developmentally appropriate practices. However, these courses are not given due weight in the overall curriculum. In addition, although some courses, such as ones focusing on developmentally appropriate practices, emphasize developing different teaching practices to meet the needs of all learners, they are perceived as unrelated to inclusive education.

Moreover, the initial teacher training programmes include an internship component where candidate teachers observe educational practices in a school related to their area of study during the first semester of their last year in university. They also have a more practical internship during the second semester where they actually prepare and teach lessons. These internships are considered to be an integral part of initial teacher training. However, their effectiveness is questioned by academics due to lack of national regulations related to the content and structure of these internships and inconsistent guidance from the educational personnel as a result of limited resources.

There is no policy yet mentioned on what is expected from the teacher education system other than what is shared on MoNE's new <u>Education Vision 2023.</u>

There are various <u>professional development trainings</u> under the inclusive education category offered by the MoNE, including but not limited to:

• Course on working with children who are affected by natural disaster

⁷ MEB ÖYGM (2018, 14 Eylül). Kapsayıcı Eğitim Projesi (Inclusive Education). meb.gov.tr. Ekim 2019, https://oygm.meb.gov.tr/www/kapsayici-egitim-projesi-inclusive-education/icerik/679

http://oygm.meb.gov.tr/www/kapsayici-egitim-projesi-inclusive-education/icerik/679

- Course on working with children with disability
- Course on working with children who are under temporary protection
- Course on working with children who are affected by migration and terrorism
- Course on introduction to inclusive education
- Course on inclusive education environments (physical and psycho-social)
- Course on teaching and assessment
- Course on school, family and society collaboration
- Course on working with children who were victims of violence
- Course on teaching Turkish as a second language
- Course on training of principals.

These teacher trainings mainly are part of UNICEF-MEB projects. The details of these projects are not shared publicly.

5.4 With respect to the main initial teacher education programmes, describe how inclusion in education is addressed in it (i.e. requirement for number of academic credits under European Credit Transfer and Accumulation System (ECTS), subjects and topics covered, focus etc).

ERG covers only K-12, thus we do not have detailed information on initial teacher education programs.

5.5 Please provide information (main conclusions, reference and a link if available) on any recent reports, evaluations and/or reviews, since 2015 relating to initial teacher education and/or professional development issues.

Ayan, M. (2016), Inclusive Education: School Practices, Teacher's Needs, ERI

This report is intended to present the data gathered through one-on-one interviews conducted with eleven minority school and public-school teachers.

The report concludes that:

- To "internalise the attainments of a possible teacher training program regarding inclusive education", teachers need to be valued.
- "Teachers need a certain flexibility in their day-to-day schedule and the pace at which they apply the curriculum."
- There is a "widespread abundance of teachers who have internalized discrimination in the education system."
- "Parents' participation is yet another aspect to be considered."
- "A proper focus on students requires inclusion of their lives outside of the school."
- "It is necessary both to devise training programs that will enable a mentality of transformation for all actors of the education practice and to conduct a thorough study on the kind of support that must be provided to teachers, other than training."
- There is a "need of support from school administration, counselling department and teaching staff."

- There is a "need for materials."
- "The discrimination at schools include religion- based, ethnic-based, gender-based, sexual
 orientation and general identity-based discriminations, alongside various other types of
 discrimination related to disability, headscarf use, poverty and ableism."
- Teachers need to develop various strategies.
- To feel sufficiently empowered, teachers need peer meeting opportunities.

5.6 Overall, what are the perceived main challenges (barriers and hinderances) and opportunities (support and ways forward) for inclusion in education in relation to teachers and support personnel in the country?

There is a need for a national policy framework and a strong teacher training program. MoNE's new Education Vision 2023 is an opportunity since there is a focus on teachers. Minister of National Education addressed as: "We must not forget that all education systems rise on the shoulders of teachers and that no education system can overshadow the qualities of that nation's teachers."

As mentioned in Ayan's (2016) report above, teacher training programs regarding inclusive education is needed and teachers need to participate actively in these programs as. The curriculum is centralized in Turkey, the curriculum, textbooks and the activities were sent by the MoNE, thus there is no room for flexibility in their day-to-day schedule and the pace at which they apply the curriculum. Thus, there occurs a lack of effective communication between between teachers and their students. As Ayan (2016) mentioned, there is also ""widespread abundance of teachers who have internalized discrimination in the education system." Involvement of parents need to be strengthened to fully benefit from benefits of parent participation. The students at school is discussed, yet out-of-school life is unknown or unforeseen.

School administration support might be missing in most cases. There can be shortages of counselling department and teaching staff. On other aspect is the active teachers. The school leaders tend to place special needs students to particular teachers only. This may cause burden. Teachers also need peer support and collaboration. "Discrimination at school may include religion- based, ethnic-based, gender-based, sexual orientation and general identity-based discriminations, alongside various other types of discrimination related to disability, headscarf use, poverty and ableism."

Section 6: Schools

How does the work of schools, school management and leadership impact on access, participation and provision of equitable opportunities for all learners?

6.1 Who is excluded from attending any form of school?

Please give reasons for this group being excluded from attending school and describe any form of alternative provision made for them?

By law being excluded from attending any form of school is forbidden. However not all children with special needs (schools are not ready, not enough personnel, age population not available, lack of screening), girls (early marriage, religious reasons), children of seasonal mobile agricultural worker families, children in poverty, children who are forced to work, Roma children, Refugee children, children living in rural areas, LGBTİ+ individuals, children of internally forced migration, children whose mother tongue is not Turkish and children who are pushed to crime are at school. There are particular programs and projects for children with special needs, girls, children of seasonal mobile agricultural worker families, children in poverty, children who are forced to work, Roma children, Refugee children, children living in rural areas.

6.2 Are there issues around the over- and under-representation of different vulnerable groups in different school settings?

No No Information available Yes

- 6.3 Please give details on the main admissions criteria for schools.
- a. Highlight any issues with the national policies.

Admissions to primary and lower secondary education is based on an address based automatic allocation system. Children, when they reach 69 months of age, automatically are listed and enrolled to the most convenient schools. Parents have the option of choosing a private school of their choice and enrolling their children. There is technically no admissions criteria apart from their home address.

For admission to higher secondary education, all children have the right to prefer being placed to a high school based on their home address, whether they take the national exam or not. They have the choice of entering the national exam and either prefer non-selective schools that do not require an exam grade or selective schools that accept students based on a national examination ranking. If the child does not have a national exam ranking, they are placed in one of their five choices based on the location of their home address, their grade average in middle school and the location of their middle school. However, while listing their preferences of placement, children can only involve a maximum of three schools from the same school type of the three school types. The three school types are: Anatolian High Schools, Anatolian Imam and Preacher High Schools, Vocational and Technical High Schools. This limitation resulted in some students having to list school types other than their wish and possibly be placed in them.

Number of children with special needs attending preschool is also very low compared to other levels. Although for children with special needs, preschool education is compulsory and free, there were only 4,771 children with special needs in preschool according to MoNE's 2018-19 data, while there were 153,503 in primary school. Therefore it is important to point out the need for inclusive policies that ensure children with special needs are diagnosed, enrolled and included in every level of education. It is important to understand the reasons behind this access issue.

b. Where schools set their own admissions criteria, please outline any impact on inclusion.

Early childhood education or preschool education is not compulsory nor free in Turkey. For example, for 2018-19, the net schooling ratio at preschool (ages 3-5) is 39.1%. Net schooling ratio at preschool for age 5 is 68,3%. Since it is not free for all, it is hard to say that education policies for these ages are inclusive. More affluent families are able to send their children to preschool while families who cannot afford to pay for education cannot. Also, due to limited capacity, preschools prefer registering older children compared to younger children.

At upper secondary level, some high schools accept students based on their ranking in the national exam. This inclusion criteria becomes an issue for inclusion in terms of access to opportunity. A students quality of education at lower secondary and primary level, the opportunities, resources and support their family provides, whether the child has to work or not, and their financial capacity to pay for additional material and instruction can become factors that impact performance on the national exam.

has to work or not, and their financial capacity to pay for additional material and instruction can become factors that
impact performance on the national exam.
6.4 Please provide information on the different forms of support that are available to learners in schools.
a. Inclusive pedagogy, personalised learning and universal design approaches
■ No ■ No information available ■ Yes
But with MoNE's new Education Vision 2023 inclusive pedagogy is aimed and Inclusive Education Teacher Training
Module Project is being implemented with support from UNICEF.
b. counselling and mentoring possibilities
No ☐ No information available ☐ Yes
According to data from 2015, the average number of students per psychological counselor was 538. Not all schools
have counselling and mentoring possibilities, and even in schools where this service is available, children may not have
access due to the high number of students in the school.
c. input from specialist teachers/therapists
No No Information available Yes
d. input from learning support assistants
No No information available Yes

e. availability of ICT / assistive technology

No No information available Yes	
Educational Informatics Network (EBA) is an online platfor	n launched and improved by the MoNE, consisting of

and parents.

f. Please describe any other forms of support available.

The PICTES project funded by the EU provides additional support courses and Turkish language courses for Syrian students in some schools. There are "Support Education Rooms" available in some schools with the aim of supporting children with special needs.

education material, videos, resources for distance education and catch-up training accessible by students, teachers

6.5 Please give a description of the strategies in place for practically supporting mainstream school staff teams to increase their capacity to be inclusive and to improve access, participation and achievement for all learners.

Strategy	Description of the focus
Inclusive education training for	In 2019, a training program on inclusive education for
school leaders	school leaders, titled "Kapsayıcı Eğitim Bağlamında Okul
	Yöneticilerinin Mesleki Gelişim Eğitim Programı" was
	provided by the Directorate General for Teacher Training
	and Development.
Inclusive education training for	As part of projects done in collaboration with MoNE and
volunteers working with Syrian	UNICEF, inclusive education training was provided to
children	Syrian volunteer teachers working at Temporary
	Education Centres.
Inclusive education training for	As part of projects done in collaboration with MoNE and
teachers	UNICEF, an inclusive education training was delivered to
	105.512 teachers who have foreign children in their
	classrooms. ⁹ The project was developed into a more
	diverse 10 module training for inclusive education, in
	collaboration with Erciyes University, including special
	modules on children with special needs, children who
	survived violence, learning turkish as a second language,
	working with refugee children, in order to support
	teachers with their more specific challenges. 10

⁹ MEB ÖYGM (2018, 14 Eylül). Kapsayıcı Eğitim Projesi (Inclusive Education). meb.gov.tr. Ekim 2019, https://oygm.meb.gov.tr/www/kapsayici-egitim-projesi-inclusive-education/icerik/679

¹⁰ http://oygm.meb.gov.tr/www/kapsayici-egitim-projesi-inclusive-education/icerik/679

6.6 Please provide information regarding school buildings and infrastructure.
a. Are there schools that face infrastructure issues that are barriers to inclusion?
No ☐ No information available ☐ Yes
There are, but data is needed to discuss further. Children with special needs, girls face these barriers.
b. Are there strategies and/or initiatives to improve school buildings and infrastructure?
☐ No ☐ No information available ☐ Yes
MoNE's new Education Vision 2023 aims to improve school buildings and infrastructure.
$6.7\ Please\ provide\ information\ (main\ conclusions, reference\ and\ a\ link\ if\ available)\ from\ any\ recent\ reports,\ systematic$
evaluations and/or reviews, since 2015 of the school system, potentially drawing on information from school
inspections and / or school self-review work.
MoNE's new Education Vision 2023 is a critical framework.

The Turkish Government signed the <u>UNESCO Salamanca Statement</u> in 1994, and promised Education For All. Yet there needs to be more transparency and accountability in terms of sharing in what ways and to what extent what is promised in these agreements is ensured. If we do not only focus on increasing the quality of special education but also aim to increase inclusiveness within the whole education system it will have more lasting benefits and would be a more holistic approach to inclusive education. Mandatory preschool education is very important for early educational identification. If it is noticed that a child is struggling before school, the family can be guided and it will have a positive impact in the child's school readiness. If families have a positive perception of school climate, they have more positive views about children who are different from their children being in the same classroom. The teacher plays a critical role in creating a positive environment in the classroom and setting an example for the students. Supporting teachers in creating this climate of inclusion is therefore an important opportunity both for being a role model for the children but also for impacting the attitudes of parents.

6.8 Overall, what are the perceived main challenges (barriers and hinderances) and opportunities (support and ways

forward) for inclusion in education in relation to schools in the country?

Inclusive education tends to be misunderstood. It is often not defined the right way. In Turkey, we have not yet reached the idea of inclusive education that means providing a learning environment for each child, but we are stuck in mainstreaming or the social cohesion of Syrian children. It is necessary to emphasise the philosophy behind it in efforts towards inclusive education. Inclusiveness also involves ethical responsibilities such as hearing the voice of

¹¹ http://egitimdeengellihaklari.org/wp-content/uploads/2019/11/tohum otizm ogretmen kilavuzu.pdf

each stakeholder, starting with children themselves. This is also important from children's rights perspective, where child participation emphasises the principle of "nothing about me without me". In defining inclusive education, it is important to take into account this ethical obligation. Accessibility is often discussed, yet it is often understood as just physical access. Accessibility is not limited to physical access but also involves access to learning, access to information. Therefore it is critical that accessibility is defined operationally at a macro level. At micro level, there seems to be a loop of blame. While all actors blame each other, it is difficult to make progress. It is important that all actors know their rights and responsibilities, including families and children themselves and gain the agency to defend their rights. Self advocacy can play an important role in attaining rights and can be achieved with a rights based approach to inclusive education. From an early age children can know and demand their rights if they wish to. The approach to mainstreaming in Turkey is a medical approach. It is about "diagnosis", and a binary perspective of defining who is able and who is not. Rather than focusing on impairment or what is missing, it is important to focus on strengths and what the child is able to do, to adopt a bio-psyco-social approach and to see "disability" as a contribution to a multicultural environment. Since schools are not only for children's academic development but also support children's social and emotional development, mainstreaming is also crucial. Mainstreaming can be a challenge for the mainstreamed child however it can have a positive impact on the child's brain development. Schools are also micro systems that reflect society. It is also important to focus on inclusion in the society and to develop efforts to promote inclusion within society. Individuals who are not included in schools are often not included in public spaces.

Section 7: Communities, parents and students

How far does the wider school community support learners to access and benefit from education opportunities?
7.1 Have there been any campaigns to raise awareness of inclusion in education at national or local level?
No ☐ No information available ☐ Yes
The most well known campaign was the "Hey Girls, Let's Go to School" campaign with support from UNICEF in 2003.
The campaign ran in 10 provinces where the gender gap was highest, and by 2006 scaled up to 81 provinces. The
campaign began as a collaboration between public institutions, non-governmental organizations, local
administrations and volunteers. The project's goal was to "close the gender gap in enrolment to primary education by
enrolling school-aged-girls (6-14 years old) who have been excluded from the education system or have never enrolled
in or had dropped out of school, in provinces where enrolment rates are lowest." At the end of the first year, there
was an increase in the number of girls enrolled in school. In 2003, 40,000 girls (in 10 provinces), in 2004, 73,200 girls
(in 33 provinces), in 2005, 62,251 girls (in 53 provinces) and in 2006, 47,349 girls (throughout Turkey), for a total of
222,800 girls, were enrolled in school. The project had great momentum during the first few years and enrolled over
5% of the total girls in that age group, the following years it lost some of its steam. One of the interpretations for this
loss was that it was due to the project expanding its focus nationwide, instead of focusing on one specific region at a
time. This experience from 'Girls, Let's Go to School' campaign suggests that when the resources and the interest
focus on a certain region and its unique challenges, rather than having a wider focus, better results are achieved.
Other than this nationwide campaign, there were/are project-based campaigns that were/are implemented in pilot
provinces.
7.2 Does legislation/policy support parental involvement in schools?
No ☐ No information available ☐ Yes
MoNE recently started to publish a bulletin for parents, giving information about how to support their child's
development and education. There are also <u>school family unions</u> .
7.3 Does legislation/policy support collaboration between schools and stakeholders in their local communities (e.g.
services/employers)?
No No information available Yes
7.4 Does legislation/policy support the development of learning communities in local/regional areas e.g. support for
schools to work together; involvement with universities, support services to provide research evidence and
development of innovative practice?
development of innovative practice.
□ No □ No information available □ Yes

7.5 Does legislation/policy set out a role for NGOs, DPOs, or other organisations representing vulnerable groups?
☐ No ☐ No information available ☐ Yes
Selected NGOs can have a seat at the steering committees of the projects and Intersectoral Child Council.

7.6 Please provide information (main conclusions, reference and a link if available) from any recent reports, systematic evaluations and/or reviews, since 2015 of parental and wider community involvement in the work of schools.

Akçınar, B. (2017). Involved fatherhood and its determinants in Turkey. Istanbul: Mother Child Education Foundation AÇEV launched the <u>Understanding Fatherhood in Turkey Series</u>, aiming to produce scientific data for all stakeholders and influence the perception of fathers and fatherhood, among different actors in society including NGO's, academia, central and local governments, as well as traditional and social media. To gain better insights as to differing practices, resources, development and transfer patterns of fatherhood and its relationship with masculinity and to share knowhow with all influential stakeholders, the series consists of three reports: 1. Involved Fatherhood and its Determinants in Turkey, 2. Fatherhood in Turkey: In the Midst of Parenthood, Masculinity and Work, 3. The States of Masculinity and Fatherhood in Turkey.

7.7 Overall, what are the perceived main challenges (barriers and hinderances) and opportunities (support and ways forward) for inclusion in education in relation to communities, parents and students in the country?

In relation to parents, it is perceived that families with low income, low education or those who do not speak Turkish

can face stigmatization from the school and other parents. The school environment may not be inclusive for them as more affluent families have better relations with schools through either contributing financially or being present, families who are not able to communicate with the language, who are not able to contribute financially or who do not have the time to contribute in any way are left out of the community. This dynamic seems to contribute to more advantaged families being more present and involved and more disadvantaged families being less involved.

Also, teachers convey that even though they make progress with the social cohesion of their students in the classroom, when families teach their children to not be friends from children from "the other" group, it impacts the dynamics in the classroom. Therefore, social cohesion between parents and also raising awareness within families about how important it is that each child feels included may be a crucial point to work on.